

EPA World Trade Center Expert Technical Review Panel



Subgroup on
Other Sources
of WTC Data
May 20, 2004 meeting

Photo by Independence Plaza North Tenants Association



Participants

- **Pat Evangelista, EPA**
- **Bob Garvey, OSHA**
- **Catherine McVay Hughes,
Community Liaison**
- **Mark Maddaloni, EPA**
- **Dave Newman, NYCOSH**
- **Krish Radhakrishnan, NYC DEP**
- **Dennis Santella, EPA**



Information shared (1)

- **Health and Technical Assistance for the World Trade Center Dust Cleaning Program, Final Report, December 9, 2002 - February 21, 2003 (OSHA)**
- **156 safety and health inspections during EPA's residential cleaning program**
- **no air samples exceeded OSHA Permissible Exposure Limits (PELs)**



Information shared (2)

- **Survey results for Lower Manhattan building exteriors (NYC DEP)**
- visual survey for WTC dust/debris on building exteriors (c. February 2002)
- cleaning of building exteriors (c. June 2002)
- approximately 250 building exteriors cleaned by DEP
- approximately 100 building exteriors cleaned by building owners




Information shared (3)

- **Letter to building owners seeking environmental sampling results for asbestos (NYC DEP)**
- target population = approximately 1,000 buildings
- responses from approximately 350 buildings
- 30 - 40 respondees reported finding asbestos
- searchable database created




Information shared (4)

- **World Trade Center Air Monitoring Activities by Various Entities, Final Report, March 17, 2003 (EPA)**
- compendium of public and private owners of data (5 private owners)
- *not* a compendium of environmental sampling data



What are the objectives of the subgroup? (1)

- **Charge:**
- **“Review and synthesize the ongoing work by the federal, state, and local governments and private entities to determine the characteristics of the WTC plume and where it was dispersed, including the geographic extent of EPA and other entities’ monitoring and testing...” (October 27, 2003 letter from James Connaughton, CEQ, to Senators Clinton and Lieberman)**




What are the objectives of the subgroup? (2)

- *Issue 1:*

- The many thousands of results of Lower Manhattan environmental sampling efforts that were conducted by and for **private organizations and individuals** comprise a potentially important part of post-9/11 environmental data, yet have not been collected for public access or scientific evaluation.

- *Issue 2:*

- Additional thousands of results of environmental sampling efforts conducted in their own quarters by **government agencies** also comprise a potentially important part of post-9/11 environmental data, yet have not been collected for public access or scientific evaluation.



What are the objectives of the subgroup? (3)

- ***Objective 1:***

- **Efforts should be made to capture, centralize, and evaluate this data, and to make it accessible.**

- ***Objective 2:***

- **This data may be used to identify buildings for possible inclusion in a comprehensive sampling effort by EPA.**

- ***Caveat:***

- **Any new sampling effort should not be postponed due to delays in obtaining existing data.**



EPA should solicit voluntary submission of environmental sampling data from:

- **building owners, building managers, apartment owners, tenants, and tenant organizations**
- **private employers and private sector workers and unions**
- **government agencies and public sector workers and unions**



EPA should seek the assistance of the following organizations in encouraging their members, clients, or constituencies to voluntarily submit environmental sampling data:

- **insurance companies**
- **AIHA, Metro AIHA, ACGIH**
- **laboratories**
- **environmental consultants and cleanup companies**
- **community boards and community organizations**
- **physicians and other health care professionals**
- **mass media (public service announcements and advertisements)**



Certain organizations are required by law to share environmental sampling results

- **government agencies (subject to Freedom of Information Law requests)**
- **public- and private-sector employers (upon request by employee or union, per 29 CFR 1910.1020 - Access to Employee Exposure and Medical Records)**



What should be done with data obtained?

- **scan documents**
- **index documents**
- **create accessible, searchable database**



Limitations

- in most cases, submission of data would be voluntary
- difficulties of outreach
- possible insurance and liability issues
- confidentiality must be surrendered if data is to be of use
- quality of data cannot be assured
- sampling methods vary - results cannot always be compared
- project cost and staffing issues